| **Student Name:** Catherine Ho |
| --- |

| **Motion**: In ethnically heterogeneous areas, This house believes that governments should pursue policies to make all schools multiethnic (e.g. setting up schools in mixed districts, requiring quotas, preferential subsidisation based on degree of representation) |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 67 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I would like a higher impact illustration of segregation - use realistic examples of what kinds of areas these are, and what the separation of different races looks like; are these immigrants, are these indigenous groups, what’s the problem? Why is there a lack of assimilation in status quo?  Set-up   * Are the stakes of this debate a diverse mindset, or racial tensions? Your framing at the moment is not very high impact. * Clear model, does it extend to private schools? You may want to introduce safeguards - for instance, do you try to maintain the selectivity of existing selective schools or overrule this? * Is this true that there are racially exclusive schools? The language we use also shouldn’t be mixed schools versus normal schools. This is very reductive. * At the end of set-up, I’m still not sure what the problem in the status quo is. Yes, separation exists but why? There’s very little analysis as to why this is true - is it due to ethnic enclaves or what? * We need to characterise what these AREAs are like; this is probably not about the entire US or Singapore, but specific neighbourhoods or locales.   Argument 1   * What does it mean for segregation to affect the future? What do we mean that they learn to work with other people? This is incredibly vague language. What mechanisms lead to any or specific change? * We need to first explain why there is a correlation between wealth and race. We can use the following analysis to do this; historically, government policies like the Homestead Act, which granted land primarily to white settlers, and the GI Bill, which provided benefits like education and housing loans disproportionately to white veterans, further widened the wealth gap. Continuing practices like redlining and discriminatory lending practices make it harder for people of colour to buy homes, a primary means of wealth accumulation. Disproportionate incarceration rates for Black Americans can lead to lost income, difficulty finding employment, and other economic hardships. * Young people’s mindsets are ‘easy to shift’ - but why do they shift? How does change occur? * What is social cohesion? What does it mean? What does it look like in real life?   There is very little mechanistic analysis in this speech. Catherine, we need to wise up and push hard because we need to at least try to prove the outcome of the argument! I want mechanistic analysis on integration! Explain how direct interaction allows individuals to challenge stereotypes, discover commonalities, and build relationships. Shared experiences foster empathy and break down barriers. Yet - this is only possible when it involves equal status between groups; proximity without these conditions can exacerbate existing tensions. School solves this! Explain the role of teachers, extra-curriculars, mixing and so forth.  Why aren’t we taking a POI?  05:58 | | | | | | |